



RESEARCH
ARTICLE

Channelers' Answers to Questions from Scientists: An Exploratory Study

Helané Wahbeh¹

hwahbeh@noetic.org

Paolo Speirn¹

pspeirn@noetic.org

Luciano Pederzoli³

pederzoli@inwind.it

Patrizio Tressoldi²

patrizio.tressoldi@unipd.it

¹Research Department, Institute of
Noetic Sciences, Novato CA, USA

²Science of Consciousness Research
Group, Studium Patavinum, Padova
University, Padova, Italy

³EvanLab, Firenze, Italy

SUBMITTED February, 28, 2023

ACCEPTED May 29, 2023

PUBLISHED October 31, 2023

<https://doi.org/10.31275/20232907>

PLATINUM OPEN ACCESS



Creative Commons License 4.0.
CC-BY-NC. Attribution required.
No commercial use.

HIGHLIGHTS

A fresh study asked channelers to access the same “nonphysical being or spirit” source and answer a set of questions from scientists. The answers and their claimed source had low agreement, but other analyses found coherent and common themes in the channeled responses for many of the questions.

ABSTRACT

Background and Objectives. This exploratory study aimed to evaluate the potential usefulness of channeled information for ten questions from scientists. The study's objectives were to 1) assess the correspondence of channeled and non-channeled answers within questions, 2) evaluate the correspondence of different channelers' responses for each question while in channeling and non-channeling states, 3) examine whether channelers believe they are receiving information from the same source, and 4) explore qualitative themes that emerge for each question. **Method.** Fifteen channelers provided answers to 10 questions in a channeled and non-channeled state. The first three objectives were quantitatively evaluated by three judges using structured criteria to assess correspondence. The last objective employed qualitative thematic analysis of the channeled answers.

Results. The quantitative analyses found 1) low correspondence between channeled and non-channeled answers as hypothesized, 2) virtually no correspondence for each question across channelers, contrary to our hypothesis, and 3) little support that the channelers perceived they were accessing the same source of information. The qualitative analysis resulted in coherent and common themes in the channeled responses for many but not all ten questions. Several methodological lessons were gleaned from the study, such as refining inclusion/exclusion criteria and the questions asked of channelers, allowing a similar amount of time for channeled and non-channeled answers, ensuring consistent methods across study sites, and including additional quantitative measures informing on the channelers experience in channeling and non-channeling states.

Conclusions. This exploratory study offers insight into improving future studies attempting to obtain valuable information through channeling.

KEYWORDS

Trance, channeling, mediumship, cross-cultural.



INTRODUCTION

Brief History of Channeling

The type of channeling in which people enter a trance has been called by various names throughout history, such as prophecy, oracle, spiritual communication, and spirit possession (Hastings, 1991). Regardless of the term used, the process appears to be similar in that the channeler receives and communicates information believed to come from some other being or dimension of reality that is different from everyday reality. Historical records suggest that this channeling type has existed worldwide, in various cultures, for over 3,000 years (Helfrich, 2009). Evidence of channeling dates back to some of humanity's earliest written records, as far back as the 14th century BCE (Hastings, 1991). Moses's reception of the Ten Commandments within Judaism and Christianity and the advice from "protector beings" or *Dharmapala* in Tibetan Buddhism could be interpreted as channeling (Plakun, 2008).

The concept of talking to or being possessed by spirits is a cultural phenomenon found in many societies worldwide, such as traditional areas of Ladakh (Crook, 1997), Spiritist groups in Brazil (Hageman et al., 2009; Negro Jr et al., 2002) and Spiritualists in the United Kingdom (Roxburgh & Roe, 2011), with cross-cultural psychiatrists and anthropologists engaging in extensive investigations of this topic (Bastos et al., 2015; Bourguignon, 1976; Cardeña et al., 2023; Hunter & Luke, 2014). A global survey in the 1970s found that 53% of 488 societies had some form of ritually-induced altered states of consciousness (Bourguignon, 1976). Multiple religious traditions include trance channeling-like rituals as part of their spiritual practices, including Spiritualists, Charismatic Catholics, Pentecostals, Spiritists, and African-American religions (Moreira-Almeida & Cardeña, 2011).

One potential reason channeling has persisted over human history is that channeling is believed to transmit valid and important information in many cultures and contexts. For example, within the spiritistic religions of Candomblé, Kardecismo, and Umbanda (Krippner, 2008; Seligman, 2005), Brazilian mediums engage in trance methods to interact with and embody "spirit agents" who are believed to carry important information, such as warning the community about potential issues, diagnosing illnesses, and prescribing cures (Hageman et al., 2009).

Source of Channeled Information

The definitive source of channeled information is currently unknown. However, possible sources have

been proposed, including the unconscious mind of the channeler, a transpersonal or "higher" self, telepathic or clairvoyant sources, and various non-physical entities (Wahbeh, 2021, pp. 105–113). Interestingly, when 83 English-speaking channelers, mostly (78%) from the United States, reported their source of channeled information in a survey, the most endorsed was the higher self (65%), followed by non-physical being groups (56%), and deceased humans (56%) (Wahbeh & Butzer, 2020). These source results may vary in non-English speaking channelers around the globe (e.g., African religions (Stöckigt, 2014)). However, the source of channeling may, in fact, be many different sources depending on the channeler, the information type they want to channel, the audience, and the situation. In addition, a single channeling session may include multiple sources that function together (Merlin, 2020). While many traditions believe channelers are directly channeling non-physical beings, this does not necessarily need to be the case for accessing useful information unavailable to the conscious mind.

Types of Information Received

Most studies show that people access different information types through channeling experiences. In our surveys, we asked people what kind of information they accessed (Sagher et al., 2019; Wahbeh & Butzer, 2020). One study included 899 people from the United States who endorsed a wide range of channeling experiences (Sagher et al., 2019) and the other 83 English-speaking trance channelers (Wahbeh & Butzer, 2020). Participants were asked to review a list of channeled content categories and select all that applied to their received messages. With few exceptions, the responses to these surveys fit within the following categories: guidance and personal messages, ageless wisdom, descriptions of life in non-physical realms, the past or the future, artistic and creative expression, scientific or technological material, health, healing, and information from or about deceased humans (Klimo, 1998, pp. 176–191).

Guidance and personal messages (78%) were the most frequently selected, followed by ageless wisdom (72%), descriptions of life in non-physical realms (60%), the future and the past (59%), healing (59%), information from or about deceased humans (53%), health (45%), artistic and creative expression (43%), and scientific or technological material (40%) (Wahbeh & Butzer, 2020). Ninety-two percent of the respondents said they channeled multiple types of information. Some respondents shared that there was no limit to the information type they received during channeling in an open text field.

Verifying the Information

Regardless of the type of information received, the more critical question is whether the information accessed through channeling is correct or useful. Researchers have evaluated whether information received from mediums about deceased humans was accurate. Historically well-documented cases of accurate information obtained by mediums include Leonora Piper (1859–1950), Gladys Leonard (1882–1968), Pearl Curran (1883–1937), Luiz Antonio Gasparetto (1949–2018), José Jacques Andrade (b. 1945), and Chico Xavier (1910–2002) (Braude, 2003; Fontana, 2005). More recently, a meta-analysis of 18 experimental studies published from 2001 to 2015 found an .18 (95% CI [.12, .25]) overall standardized effect size, corresponding to approximately 6 to 14% above chance level, estimated with both frequentist and Bayesian random-effects models and that passed publication bias tests (Sarraf et al., 2021). Another review evaluated data from studies where sitters (the loved ones of deceased individuals) provided binary accuracy responses for mediumistic readings and did not find significant positive findings (Rock et al., 2021). Perhaps even more interesting is another study that evaluated the accuracy of mediums and controls to ascertain the cause of death of 180 facial photographs (Delorme et al., 2020). Researchers found a significant above-chance result for controls *and* mediums, with the results being primarily driven by control responses. That is, in this study, one did not need to be a medium to accurately obtain information about a deceased person. Despite not knowing the actual source of information,¹ Some, but not all, studies demonstrate that mediums (and controls) can provide information about deceased persons that they could not possibly know through traditional means beyond what would be expected by chance.

Could the Information Be Useful?

However, these results focus on information about deceased humans. What about whether getting useful information about questions from scientists is possible? Could channeling be used to acquire valuable answers to science-related questions? Moreover, if so, is that information actionable? Many scientific breakthroughs have been attributed to channeling (Schwartz, 1990). Srinivasa Ramanujan was a mathematical theorist who believed he received many formulas from the Indian goddess Namagiri and Saraswati, the deity of language, song, and logic. His peers recognized his work as excellent (Hastings, 1991, p. 18). Other scientists have commented that their remarkable ideas do not originate with them but rather from something beyond themselves. For example, Thomas Edison said,

People say I have created things. I have never created anything. I get impressions from the Universe at large and work them out, but I am only a plate on a record or a receiving apparatus—what you will. Thoughts are really impressions that we get from outside. (quoted in Dossey, 2013, p. xiv)

These are just a few examples of scientists who received inspiration through perhaps channeling experiences that inspired scientific discoveries. Many channelers feel they receive scientific or technological information through channeling. Channeling researcher Jon Klimo had planned to include a summary of scientific or technical channeled information in his comprehensive book on channeling. However, while summarizing the collated books, articles, and unpublished manuscripts he had collected, Klimo (1998) developed over 50,000 words of content and decided to include the information in a separate book (p. 192). As far as we know, that book has not yet been published. Still, Klimo's experience reflects the vast volume of channeled materials said to be scientifically or technologically relevant but have not been thoroughly examined.

One of the few verified channeled scientific information examples was from Chico Xavier. Xavier possessed many alleged mediumistic abilities, including psychography or writing under the apparent influence of a non-physical being. Xavier was a prodigious channel, producing over 450 books psychographically on various content, including scientific topics. One formal study compared the information he channeled about the pineal gland in the 1940s to current scientific evidence (Lucchetti et al., 2013). The authors found multiple themes from Xavier's writings that matched the current understanding of the pineal gland, such as its relationships to mental health, reproductive function, endocrinology, exercise, spirituality, and the importance of the hormone secreted by the gland. Importantly, what Xavier communicated regarding the pineal gland in the 1940s was not yet scientifically known at that time. Only by comparing the content to today's scientific understanding of the pineal gland is it possible to appreciate that much of it was accurate.

Allan Kardec, the founder of Spiritism, speaks of the process of receiving scientific or other information from channelers. Spiritism purports that humans are all immortal beings temporarily embodied and implies positive and negative effects from spirits on living humans (Lucchetti et al., 2013). He suggests that the information received by channelers on any spiritual or scientific topic rarely is transmitted completely, asserting that "spirits have divided the labor by disseminating the subjects of study and observation, as in certain factories different

parts of the object manufactured are divided among different workman" (Kardec, 2022, sec. 52). Thus, collating information from many channelers and comparing notes may result in a more comprehensive view of a given topic. Kardec (2022) suggests this process is not unusual, as science proceeds similarly, with many often contributing to some scientific understanding:

There is no science which has, in all its parts, proceeded from the brain of one man. All, without exception, are the product of successive observations, leaning upon preceding ones, as upon a known point, in order to arrive at an unknown one. (sec. 54)

Many channelers and their sitters can be frustrated because they do not receive an answer to their questions, or the answers they do receive appear contradictory or inconclusive. Kardec (2022) explains this phenomenon, proposing that only when the time is right is the information transmitted universally. Interestingly, Kardec recommends how to discover valuable scientific information through channeling. Using a systematic cross-correspondence approach, Kardec suggests gathering channeled information to compare and analyze them, discerning the confidence level one should assign them as well as those that are contradictory, illogical, or incorrect in order to create a complete picture of the channeled question or topic (sec. 52).

This also highlights the point that channeling is not always accurate at best and is blatant fraud at worst (Alcock, 1996). For example, the famous channeler Edgar Cayce provided over 14,000 well-documented readings in his lifetime, many of which were verified for accuracy. However, not all were, and some have suggested that Cayce "was guilty of searching for answers from 'inappropriate sources' and that his own biases would have filtered the information, especially in nonmedical readings" (Johnson, 1998, p. 88). Others are skeptical of Cayce's work because all the positive case reports are anecdotal, and no controlled studies of Cayce's abilities were conducted. Furthermore, his readings were guided by clinicians who "interpreted" them for his clients (Beyerstein, 1996). Some famous channelers have been accused of fraud, such as Helene Blavatsky, who was judged an imposter by the Society for Psychical Research in 1885 (Alcock, 1996). Much of this skepticism stems from the alleged source of the channeled material because it is difficult to definitively verify whether the content arises from some aspect of the channeler or from the purported source. Some have suggested setting aside the question of the source until adequate tools exist to confirm or deny

the true source of channeled information; in the meantime, the focus can remain on the validity and usefulness of the content itself (Wahbeh, 2021, pp. 119–120).

Along these lines, and in an attempt to evaluate the potential usefulness of channeled information about questions from scientists more formally, we conducted an exploratory study, which is the first of its type as far as we know. We asked channelers from the United States and Italy to answer ten questions during channeling and non-channeling states. The objectives of the study were to: 1) assess the correspondence of channeled and non-channeled answers within questions, 2) evaluate the correspondence of different channelers' responses for each question while in channeling and non-channeling states, 3) examine whether U.S.-based channelers believe they are receiving information from the same source, and 4) qualitatively analyze the channeled answers for both the United States and Italy for common themes for each question. Finally, we informally asked scientists to evaluate the answers for their usefulness.

METHODS

Participants

Participant recruitment and inclusion criteria for both sites are described below. Because of the exploratory nature of this study, each site proceeded with recruitment and inclusion criteria independently, resulting in different methods. Some recruitment method variation is expected, considering the studies were conducted in separate countries. However, future studies should be pre-registered with consistent methods across sites (as much as practically feasible considering differences in local ethical guidelines).

United States. We recruited participants through a subject-specific listserv, blog, and general email list (membership ~65,000), social media (membership ~85,000), and listservs in the channeling community. Inclusion criteria were: English fluency, over 18 years old, ability to correspond by video chat and email, self-reported ability to initiate channeling sessions at will, and history of receiving scientific or technological information through channeling. Participants were compensated \$100 for completing all three sessions. All study activities were approved and overseen by the Institutional Review Board (IRB) at the Institute of Noetic Sciences (IORG#0003743).

Italy. Participants were selected according to the following inclusion criteria: having practiced at least ten sessions of channeling induced after hypnotic suggestions with the same hypnotist and being strongly interested in participating in scientific investigations related to channeling. All study activities were approved and overseen by

the EvanLab Ethical Committee prot. n. 2/2020, and participants were not compensated for their participation.

PROCEDURE

Question Selection

HW contacted approximately 100 scientists worldwide through a parapsychology listserv with the following request:

We are developing a group channeling protocol. Part of the study will include a list of science questions from which one or two will be selected and asked of multiple channelers simultaneously. They will answer the question in a non-channeling state and then in a channeling state. This will be done through video conferencing so that the channelers will not see/hear the other participants' answers. Do you have any science questions you would like to be included on our question list?

To this request, we received 47 questions from 12 scientists (two physicists; one critical theorist; four psychologists, three of whom also call themselves parapsychologists; two neuroscientists, one economist; one computer scientist; and one physician researcher) hailing

from four countries (Australia, Italy, United States, and the United Kingdom). HW and PT reviewed the entire list of questions, narrowing it down to 10 that would be posed to the participants. The selected questions were chosen because of their content interest to the investigators. Some questions were scientific in nature, and others were metaphysical or philosophical. Question #4 differed between sites because of confusion about the final choice for that question, and two different questions were administered at each location. Additional site meetings would have supported a greater understanding and confirmation of the final questions. The questions are listed in Table 1. Note that Question 4US was included only for the United States-based respondents, while Question 4I was used only for Italy-based respondents.

Research Sessions

United States. A research assistant asked the participants the questions over three online video chat sessions, each approximately one hour in length. These sessions were designed so that the research assistant could observe the participants while answering the questions to ensure that they did not text, email, or otherwise research the answers during the answer period. The participants did not know the questions they would be asked before they were posed. During the session, the participants were instructed to answer questions in both non-chan-

Table 1. Questions Posed to U.S.- and Italy-Based Channelers

#	Question Code	Full Question
1	Nature of "Observation"	The Physicist describes an observation as a "collapse of the wave function," or, as a possibility turning into actuality, or as a realization in mind of one branch of the multi-universe. From your vantage point, what does an "OBSERVATION" look like?
2	Reincarnation	How do you explain the succession of incarnation experiences in a timeless dimension?
3	Pre-life experience	Who or what prepares the physical body for his/her own incarnation? How is it created?
4US	Universal constant	US: Just as Planck's Constant sets the scale of quantum phenomena and the Fine Structure Constant the scale of electromagnetism, is there a UNIVERSAL CONSTANT (or constants) that characterize the mind/matter interaction? What is the magnitude of dimensions of this (these) constant(s), and how could we go about measuring these numbers?
4I	Supernova	Italy: What month and year will the next supernova occur, and in what part of the sky (specific constellation, if possible, or North or Southern Hemisphere)?
5	What is matter?	What is what humans call "matter" made of?
6	Why we forget?	Why is it that with each new incarnation or experience of life, we are not reminded of all the previous experiences and of our true nature?
7	What is love?	What is love?
8	Nearest exoplanet with intelligent life	What is the nearest exoplanet that harbors intelligent life?
9	Creative force	What creates life in plants, animals, bacteria, etc.?
10	Nature of dark matter	What is the nature of dark matter, and how could it be detected?

Note. Question 4US was included only for the United States-based respondents, while Question 4I was used only for Italy-based respondents.

neling and channeling states. Answering a question in a non-channeled state allowed the study team to ascertain the channeler's baseline understanding of the question and the answer from their rational mind. The stated intention for the channeling state was that the channelers would attempt to tap into the same source for the information in an attempt to maximize correspondence between the answers. Ultimately, we can not definitively demonstrate the origin of channeled information. However, channelers believe they can access data from specific sources, so soliciting their perceived information source would be useful to evaluate corroboration. Before the sessions, participants were asked to decide how to record their responses to questions: typing their answers in the Zoom chat (preferred) or via an audio recording that was then transcribed.

The first two video sessions covered three study questions each. The third session covered four questions. All sessions consisted of the following steps:

1. Introductions and a brief explanation of the study from the principal investigator (session one only).
2. The research assistant then asked one of the questions, displaying the question on the channelers' screens.
3. In a non-channeling state, channelers had five minutes to record their answers using their rational mind. Channelers were instructed not to use any research, telepathy, or other sources of information to answer the question. This process was repeated for each question being presented for that session.
4. After answering all the questions in a non-channeled state, the channelers were invited to enter a channeling state and connect to the same source or being as other channelers.
5. Then, the research assistant asked the same questions, displaying the question on the channelers' screens.
6. The channelers had 10 minutes to enter the channeled state and answer the question by typing into the chat or recording their verbal answer. The longer time for channeled answers allowed channelers to enter the channeling state. All participants were muted, so they could not hear each other. This process was repeated for each question being presented for that session.
7. After all questions for that session were answered in both non-channeled and channeled states, the session was complete for the day.

The sessions were conducted on January 21, January 22, and January 28, 2021, from 3:30 p.m. to 5 p.m. PST. Participants who recorded themselves orally sent their audio files to the researchers. Then files were then pro-

fessionally transcribed by ScriptoSphere™ (<https://www.scriptosphere.com>). Italian channelers provided their responses in Italian, which were translated into English by author PT.

ANALYSES

What is the Correspondence Between Channeled and Non-Channeled Answers? (U.S. Data)

All statistical tests were conducted in Stata 15.0, StataCorp, LLC, College Station, TX. First, each answer's number of characters was calculated by channeling versus non-channeling state. A Wilcoxon matched-pairs signed-rank test (*signrank*) was conducted to evaluate differences in text volume for channeled versus non-channeled answers; the number of character variables was not normally distributed (*swilk*). A non-parametric Kruskal-Wallis equality of populations rank test (*kwallis*) was used to evaluate text volume by question, channeler, and state (channeling/non-channeling), which results in a chi-square statistic (χ^2). Three judges reviewed the channeled and non-channeled answers to each question for each channeler. They rated the correspondence between the two answers according to the following Correspondence Rating Scale:

- 3 - Good correspondence with relatively little differing information/content.
- 2 - Good correspondence with several matchable elements intermixed with some differing information/content.
- 1 - Some matching elements, but not sufficient to suggest results beyond chance expectation.
- 0 - No Correspondence.

The judges' scores were averaged across questions within channelers and across channelers. Interrater reliability was assessed with percent agreement (*kappa* etc). We hypothesized that averaged scores would be ≤ 2 for each question. We included this hypothesis to evaluate whether participants "simulate" channeling or enter a different consciousness state.

What is the Correspondence Between Channelers on Channeled Answers? (U.S. data)

First, the number of characters was calculated for each answer by the channeler. The Friedman test, a non-parametric alternative to the repeated measures analysis of variance, was conducted to evaluate differences in text volume by channeler (*emh*). Three judges reviewed the channeled answers for each question across

Table 2. Number of Characters for Answers and Correspondence Score by Channeling or Non-Channeling State

#	Question	Number of Characters				Correspondence Score	
		Non-Channelled		Channelled		Mean	SD
		Mean	SD	Mean	SD	Mean	SD
1	Nature of "observation"	292	160	2419	2086	0.86	0.50
2	Reincarnation	338	170	2183	2102	1.29	0.59
3	Pre-life experience	467	291	1576	1198	1.29	0.40
4	Universal constant	159	150	3101	2777	0.90	0.37
5	What is matter?	190	188	1587	1372	0.71	0.52
6	Why we forget?	507	294	2579	2067	1.14	0.33
7	What is love?	256	184	2295	1884	1.20	0.30
8	Nearest exoplanet with intelligent life	289	371	2266	1517	1.06	0.80
9	Creative force	178	133	2811	2176	1.61	0.53
10	Nature of dark matter	167	155	2623	1539	1.06	0.80
Total		289	239	2335	1855	1.12	0.56

Notes. U.S. participants were given 5 minutes for non-channelled answers and 10 minutes for channelled answers. U.S. channelers were given an extra 5 minutes compared to non-channelled answers to enter the channeling state. This extra time might have been a factor in more characters for the channeling condition if channelers could enter the channeling state quickly. Italian channelers were allowed all the time they needed in both conditions.

channelers. They rated the correspondence between each pair of channelers according to the Correspondence Rating Scale in a pairwise fashion. For example, the three judges gave separate ratings for the answer for question 1 for channelers 1 and 2, channelers 1 and 3, channelers 1 and 4, etc. This resulted in 181 pairwise comparisons with three ratings each. The judges' scores were averaged for each pairwise comparison (181 values) and then averaged for each question (10 values). We hypothesized that averaged scores would be ≥ 3 for each question. A score of three or greater was chosen to represent the highest level of correspondence between channelers. A Kruskal-Wallis equality-of-populations test evaluated any statistical differences in the correspondence scores by question. The non-parametric Kruskal-Wallis test was used because the correspondence score variable was not normally distributed.

Do Channelers Report Accessing Information from the Same Source? (U.S. Data)

Channelers were asked what they believed the source of their channelled information was for each question. These answers were qualitatively compared across channelers. We anticipated that the disclosed source would be the same because of the shared intention to connect to the same source. Thus, we hypothesized that 80% of the

channelers would report accessing the same source for some questions. This threshold was chosen as substantial but not perfect agreement of source information ($< 0 = \text{Poor}$, $0-20 = \text{Slight}$, $21-40 = \text{Fair}$, $41-60 = \text{Moderate}$, $61-80 = \text{Substantial}$, $81-100 = \text{Almost Perfect}$; Landis & Koch, 1977).

Thematic Analysis (U.S. and Italy Data)

A dataset in Microsoft Excel (Redmond, WA) was created for the textual responses. Each answer was listed on one row with the following variables: country (the United States or Italy), channeler (ID), question (1 through 10), and state (channeling or non-channeling). The dataset was uploaded into Dedoose web-based qualitative data analysis software (Dedoose, 2013).

Thematic analysis characterized the data by grouping repeated semantic code patterns into meaningful categories/themes, as Braun and Clarke (2006) described. Thematic analysis was chosen because it can provide a straightforward yet rich description of participants' beliefs and experiences. Thematic analysis consists of six steps: familiarization, coding, generating themes, reviewing themes, defining and naming themes, and reporting. The approach to coding was inductive (Saldana, 2013). The researchers performed the initial coding and applied descriptive labels generated by the data using the follow-

ing steps: 1) Read through both channeled and non-channeled answers once to become familiar with the data; 2) Read through everything again, this time making notes on general observations and themes for each question; 3) Read through everything again, this time proposing codes for each question; and 4) After generating a list of preliminary codes for each question, continually refine and consolidate the codes into 7–12 codes per question as well as 12 overall codes that applied to every question.

The final codebook was developed with definitions and a brief description of when to use each code. Each answer was independently coded in duplicate (once by each researcher) using Dedoose. Coding was iterative, with each researcher going over the data at least twice each. There were less than ten discrepancies in coding, and were resolved through researcher discussion until a consensus was reached. Theme summaries are provided in the results section with representative quotes for the descriptive analysis. Quotes from the data were edited with articles, punctuation, and extra clarification to support the reading flow and comprehension.

RESULTS

Participants: United States

Sixty-seven individuals responded to the survey providing information about their channeling background and experience channeling scientific information. These responses were reviewed for 15 participants who had > 11 channeling sessions, could channel at will, and were comfortable with the idea of channeling scientific or technical information, who were then invited to participate. Seven agreed to participate, having experienced more than 50 channeling sessions.

Based on their responses to our intake survey, all seven participants identified as women. Five were between the ages of 39 and 52, one was 55, and one was 66 years old ($M = 49$, $SD = 9$). Four were of only European ancestry, one was of Native American and European ancestry, one was of only Latinx or Hispanic ancestry, and one was of only Native Pacific Islander ancestry. All participants claimed to have channeled specific beings. While all answered positively about being comfortable channeling scientific or technical information beyond their personal knowledge, one did not have experience doing so. The channelers self-selected multiple types of channeling abilities: mediumship (6), trance channeling (5), automatic writing (5), clairvoyance (2), clairaudience (7), and clair empathy (6). All seven channelers attended all sessions. While we did not formally assess spiritual or religious affiliation, we informally asked the channelers after the study for this information. Four (out of seven)

channelers responded and shared that they were raised Catholic (3) or Christian (1) and were currently Catholic (1), Christian/spiritual but not religious (1), and spiritual but not religious (2).

Participants: Italy

Seven females and one male were selected among the participants of the EvanLab panel, given their experience in hypnosis and hypnotically induced channeling with the same hypnotist. The Italian channelers had, on average, 100 hours of experience. Their chronological age ranged from 35 to 67 years old ($SD = 15$). The hypnotist had more than 20 years of experience in research hypnosis. The Italian channelers were not asked about their spiritual or religious affiliation. Italian Catholicism is the dominant religion in Italy, and as far as the researcher knows, no Italian channelers were active members of “new age” groups.

What is the Correspondence Between Channeled and Non-Channeled Answers?

Channeled answers were significantly longer than non-channeled answers (Table 2; $z = -6.77$, $p < .00005$), although this may be because of the longer amount of time given for channeled answers for the US channelers. The correspondence scores for channeled versus non-channeled answers were low over all questions ($M = 1.12$, $SD = 0.56$, range 0.86 to 1.61). The highest correspondence was found for question nine. The interrater reliability as measured by percent agreement was .56 overall (range .33 to .78). The hypothesis that these correspondence scores would be ≤ 2 for each question was supported.

What is the Correspondence Between Channelers on Channeled Answers?

There was a marked difference in the number of characters for the channeled answer text by channeler (C1: $M = 626$, $SD = 174$; C2: $M = 569$, $SD = 205$; C3: $M = 4241$, $SD = 1754$; C4: $M = 2376$, $SD = 1077$; C5: $M = 3047$, $SD = 1104$; C6: $M = 557$, $SD = 109$; C7: $M = 4224$, $SD = 1294$). Channelers 3 and 7 had almost twice as much text as the others. The correspondence scores between channelers by question ranged from $M = 0.36$, $SD = 0.51$ for question eight to $M = 1.51$, $SD = 0.28$ for question nine. The correspondence scores significantly differed across questions ($\chi^2(9) = 61.9$, $p = .0001$). The interrater reliability, as measured by percent agreement, was .46 overall (range from .40 to .70). The hypothesis that these correspondence scores would be ≥ 3 for each question was not supported.

Do Channelers Report Accessing Information From

the Same Source?

There were 16 sources listed by the U.S. channelers for the information they received: collective, which is a group of beings from another universe; a different group of entities (a micro collective consciousness); Arcturians; Collective of the 1200; Edgar Mitchell; God energy; Jesus; Pleiadian collective which includes Arcturians, Blue avians; Sashastra; The Keeper; The Light; The Purist; The Scientist; Different unnamed source; The Telluride (Large male being in white robes, long straight hair, an Asian sort of stance, but hulking in stature); and The Wind (an energy mass, swirling with light blue). We had hypothesized that 80% of channelers would list the same source of their information, but this was not supported. Multiple channelers did mention a collective of beings or something similar. Four channelers reported the same source across questions, and three gave different sources depending on the question.

Thematic Analysis of Channeled Answers – U.S. and Italy Data

Overall, the data showed significant differences in the amount of text provided by country ($X^2(1) = 78.3, p = .0001$). The number of characters for Italian channelers for all questions was $M = 360.9, SD = 284.8$ (range 156 to 559). In contrast, the number of characters for United States channelers was $M = 2340.3, SD = 1854.4$ (range 1581 to 2628). The Italian channelers provided their answers in Italian; thus, their shorter responses were not dependent

Table 3. Correspondence Scores Across Channelers for Each Question

#	Question	Pairs	Correspondence Score	
		N	Mean	SD
1	Nature of "Observation"	21	1.02	0.34
2	Reincarnation	21	0.97	0.52
3	Pre-life experience	21	0.41	0.53
4	Universal constant	21	0.84	0.49
5	What is matter?	21	1.01	0.42
6	Why we forget?	21	0.90	0.35
7	What is love?	10	1.13	0.42
8	Nearest exoplanet with intelligent life	15	0.36	0.34
9	Creative force	15	1.51	0.28
10	Nature of dark matter	15	1.00	0.31
Totals		181	0.90	0.51

on English fluency. The thematic analysis resulted in multiple codes for each question. The U.S. channelers gave more examples or metaphors to describe their answers than the Italian channelers. All provided answers are publicly available on Figshare10.6084/m9.figshare.19971104. The codes are listed in the Supplemental Data section. Theme summaries are provided below with representative quotes for the descriptive analysis. Quotes are followed by channeler code (I = Italy; US = United States).

Question 1. The Physicist Describes an Observation as a "Collapse of the Wave Function," or as a Possibility Turning Into Actuality, or as a Realization in Mind of One Branch of the Multi-Universe. From Your Vantage Point, What Does an "OBSERVATION" Look Like?

Seven of the 15 channelers mentioned multiple universes, and the others did not refute that there are multiple universes. Reality was expressed as multi-dimensional with infinite potentiality. Observation was described as one finite point in a field of infinite possibilities: "An observation...has finite properties, whereas the possibility has the properties of infinity" (US6) and "So, we could explain observation as being one point that is simultaneously infinite in and of itself as it is infinitely expanding, as it has its own energy field, and is breathing and existing and shifting and changing" (US5).

Channeler 16 stated, "In the presence of many universes, the observer creates the desired universe at that moment." The observation is created by intention focused on a specific space-time. US7 stated,

When you humans observe from your vantage point, it is simply because you're focusing on and bringing the attention to that point in time in your timeline. In this multiverse, in the vastness of space, there is no time, distance, or space, yes. So, what we are seeing is a folding in and a stopping in an observation...

Two channelers likened this collapse function to an image in a movie, e.g., "for example, the way you might see it as a million movies flashing in front of your eyes a million times and catch one frame" (US7). According to I5:

In a way, it's as if there were many still frames from which to choose to create a sequence for a movie. A particular frame has meaning when in that sequence...but if inserted into another sequence – another movie – it could take on a different meaning.

They also shared that it is a function of human perception that there is a collapse, a finite point, but that in reality, there is no such collapse as everything is connected and full of infinite potential: "So, there is no collapse of anything. Only a collapse of the human's notion of separateness" (US4).

Intention and choice (i.e., free will) create the collapse. The observers choose to observe and direct their intention to some space-time. One channeler explained this process as a binary system: "Reality is multi-dimensional and contains a specific dimension with only two alternatives, 1 (yes)/0 (no), and gives rise to the phenomenon" (17). This ultimately leads to the idea that the observer creates the reality they are observing. Depending on the context from which they observe, reality will appear different. 16 stated, "In the presence of many universes, the observer creates the desired universe at that moment."

Another theme that arose was that observation affects reality. That is, the intention to observe influences the world around the observer. Many channelers communicated that the act of observing impacts material reality, e.g., "Regarding the act of observing something, each time there is an intention to observe there is a chain reaction that alters that same level of reality and consequently other states too" (14). Channelers also alluded to aspects of reality that we do not yet understand. For example,

For the mind to grasp these concepts, a new paradigm must account for wave-like particles that behave in a way similar to quarks. Yet to be discovered, these particles have a mass of greater value but an acceleration that makes them difficult to measure or even conceive. (US6)

Others implied that the question was simplistic in that it assumed observation was something specific that could be isolated. 15 stated,

These three possibilities can co-exist, because, in a way, they're all true. The particle exists in the multiverse, and its observation is the same as "looking" at it in the pre-chosen Universe, or choosing it randomly, or taking a snapshot of the wave function at a certain moment: in all three cases, it is based on the probability of finding a particle in a certain point at a certain time, and the observed particle at that moment exists because its appearance is "created."

Also, direct answers to the question were rare and mostly inconclusive. One typical example: "It's not the

same observation that you see with your eyes. We do not have eyes from our vantage point...From our vantage point in the multiverse, we see endless space and lines of creation" (US7).

Another interesting concept for this question was about supposed space travel in light ships by uniting two disparate focal points in awareness:

...collapsing of wave functions that you refer to are actually points of jumping in space as well because there is no time, distance, or space; it's simply a focal awareness where you line up a coming together of your awareness of where you are, and where you want to travel to... And this is how our light ships can travel between these points. This is also a black hole. (US7)

Thus, the overall themes for Question 1 revolve around infinite potentialities existing in the multi-dimensional space of multiple universes that are observed through intentioned focus as one point in space-time through the observer's context, which appears different depending on the context.

Question 2. How Do You Explain the Succession of Incarnation Experiences in a Timeless Dimension?

Channelers were nearly unanimous in one part of their response to this question: The linear, successive nature of time is an illusion. This means the common understanding of a single enduring soul/entity returning to this plane of existence in different, successive physical forms is not entirely accurate. As one channeler said, "There are not multiple physical lives - it's like putting on different clothes. What is interpreted as successive lives are actually simultaneous and can be counted in any order, even in terms of evolution of consciousness" (17).

They expressed that timelessness is not the same as no time. Time only exists on the material plane. In the non-physical dimension, there is an infinite continuum. Thus, the same being can experience lives in multiple times simultaneously that appear linear from a human perspective. What is labeled as "past lives" are actually only different simultaneous experiences of the same consciousness: "all of these timelines are happening at the same time...even though from your vantage point, you're only having one lifetime at this time" (US7). The lives are not in temporal sequence, but each level is contrasted with the others in terms of awareness.

Other comments broadened the idea that there is no linear time to include space and multiple dimensions. 14 stated,

The same being lives on multiple levels. For you, it's like a three-dimensional effect so that many human beings, on different levels, can share the same 'soul,' the same consciousness. What are labeled 'past lives' are really only different and simultaneous experiences of the one consciousness...

One channeler gave the metaphor of life as a movie:

It's like having many movies: each movie is a life. We can watch one, then another, and so on, seeing them as successive lives, but they are all simultaneously present. They are sequential from our point of view because it is instructional, an "experience of lives." (I5)

The individual consciousness is part of a larger consciousness, and that consciousness can shift to experience different aspects and that those lives influence each other. I4 explained,

They are not in temporal sequence, but the level of each is contrasted with the others in terms of awareness. It's a relative judgment which is continually expressed and influences life and the choices of all humans who are part of the same consciousness, the same "soul."

Other comments expanded on the idea that reincarnation results in wisdom not because it happens sequentially but because it adds to a soul's experience in a non-linear fashion. US7 stated, "It's really just more about experiencing, expanding, creating, and aligning, and becoming more and more and more of a creator."

Overall, the channelers communicated that our senses narrow the human perception of time and space, that we have multiple lives, and that from our perspective, they may be sequential in linear time but that, in actuality, they are all happening simultaneously in no-time.

Question 3. Who or What Prepares the Physical Body for His/Her Own Incarnation? How is it Created?

Who or what prepares? There were diverse answers in response to who or what prepares. Two channelers from Italy mentioned a matrix, one as "the matrix of invisible worlds" (I3) and another as "a matrix expressed by the Supreme beings" (I4). Two channelers talked about the intent to have an experience, which then produces a plan for incarnation. I5 stated, "The intent to have an experience produces the plan." US7 stated, "But it is mostly

and truly the intent of the consciousness of what it wants to expand and create and co-create together with the other consciousnesses that are curious and expanding and growing and creating together."

There was an apparent dichotomy in the amount of preparation required. Channelers offered a wide range of often conflicting perspectives. For instance, participants were split on whether the spirit and body went through a high or low level of preparation before being incarnated. Multiple channelers stated that there was significant preparation: "The spirit that will inhabit the body is what must be prepared. It is a difficult journey, one that requires complete healing from previous experiences. The soul is prepared as one might prepare for a sacred ritual" (US6), and "you are involved in co-creating your form and co-creating your physical body, and... there are many stages to preparing the physical body pre-incarnation to this earth body that you know, or that you are currently inhabiting at this time. (US5)

Others mentioned that the soul is a director of what their life and body would look like and that the soul decides the experiences it wants for expansion. In coordination with a guidance team, it receives an assignment for its growth. Then, it chooses its family and what its life will look like in an attempt to obtain those experiences. US3 stated,

When the individual identifies what they are to become for their own evolution and expansion as a soul. They are given an assignment for such expansion that the soul is the one that decides how it wishes to expand. And then it is in coordination with spirit to receive that assignment.

Another participant asserted the opposite:

There is no dress rehearsal... Life doesn't end. It's just a different place that you go to learn, reflect, and accept responsibility for the things you need to do from your previous actions. You could have been living on Sirius B as a blue person, or as a prisoner of War, or you could be an ethereal helper in an inter-dimension, helping those who are struggling to cross. It all doesn't matter in terms of preparation; it just is. (US4)

How is it created? Overall, responses to how the physical body was created were particularly diverse. Channelers rarely answered the question directly. Varied answers included being based on harmony or disharmony acquired in other lives and karma. For example, one channeler shared, "It's a cluster of sub-atomic particles that

come together in an ever more complex way, following a construction plan, a matrix expressed by the Supreme Beings" (I4). Another expressed that the body is created "from the void, from a breath, and is made of primary structures" (I6). A third shared that "the human structure is a mirror of the greater collective crystalline consciousness that is earth" (US5).

One answer began with the physical aspects but also included the metaphysical:

The physical body is created by two cells which unite... Before conception, there is a plan shared with the incoming Essence; even the accompanying thought-forms ... based on what occurred in the previous life and what will be required in the new life. (I8)

Another channeler gave a somewhat similar answer in that consciousness and intention were essential aspects of the creation process: "the body is created from that light, from that mind, from the programming, of course, within the cells, which as you know already, but it is mostly and truly the intent of the consciousness" (US7).

Finally, the theme related to multiple parallel lives that arose in Question 2 was also present here: "An Essence may, however, live multiple parallel lives simultaneously on different dimensional planes, multiple gestations with associated births, on multiple planes" (I8).

In summary, Question 3 revealed answers ranging from the physical to the metaphysical, with various descriptions of who or what prepared the body and how the physical body was prepared. Perhaps the only similarity was that channelers described it as a complex, intentional process.

Question 4 Italy. What Month and Year will the Next Supernova Occur, and in What Part of the Sky (Specific Constellation if Possible, or North or Southern Hemisphere)?

The eight channelers in Italy gave eight very different answers to this question. Three (I2, I5, I8) commented that providing a definite answer to the question was impossible. For example, I5 stated, "Future predictions assume precise agreements in time, which in reality does not exist; it is also necessary to know which future path will be undertaken. Certainly, there will be a supernova, but precisely placing this event into your reality lies outside my ability – there are too many variables."

The dates given by the other channelers were 2024, 2050, 3000, and 6050. For the locations, two channelers gave the location of Leo, with one adding Antares. Other answers were Cassiopeia, Andromeda, and Northern

Hemisphere (Scorpius or Serpens).

Question 4 illustrated a lack of coherence on a question requiring specific answers. Whether the question is not knowable or all the various answers are accurate is unknown. The 2024 prediction in the constellation Leo will be testable in a couple of years. The others will not happen in most of our lifetimes.

Question 4 US. Just as Planck's Constant Sets the Scale of Quantum Phenomena and the Fine Structure Constant the Scale of Electromagnetism, is There a UNIVERSAL CONSTANT (or Constants) That Characterize the Mind/Matter Interaction? What is the Magnitude of Dimensions of This (These) Constant(s), and How Could We Go About Measuring These Numbers?

Is there a Universal constant that characterizes the mind/matter interaction? Three channelers (US3, US5, US7) mentioned the heart or electromagnetic field of the heart as the constant; for example, "We would say that the heart field is the governor of all the wholeness that exists" (US5). One channeler gave specific frequencies: "starting with the heart frequency I think is 528 hertz above, which -- there are lower ones that can create some things, but the experiments that you're specifically looking for are 528 Hz and above" (US7).

The other answers to this question were quite varied. They ranged from "The mind of God is the source of all creation" (US2) to "It's related to the Fibonacci sequence, but the vibration changes, so there's a dynamic there" (US7) to "intentional thought via creative love" (US2). Five of the seven channelers mentioned light or aspects of light. For example, dark or cold star energy was mentioned as a pure source of light and creation:

Grand Central Sun, or a source light energy field, a sort of nucleic structure that is operating in the center...your source light is in many ways a golden kind of energy, and there's a lot of heat, fire, electricity that moves out from it. (US5)

Another channeler mentioned that one can only "see" the constant when it has created versus "the emptiness, darkness and void when it is not there and has not created light" (US2).

However, none of their answers offered a useful, specific number, and the wide range of answers did not suggest a clear path for further study. Most channelers did not mention the magnitude of dimensions. One channeler stated, "The magnitude varies within and between the species/entities being considered" (US6).

Notably, none of the channelers denied a universal

constant governing mind/matter interaction. We prepared a code for this, but we only used it to tag a single excerpt, “The first answer to this question is, there is no such thing as a constant...The only universal constant is constant creation, and every constant creation lives within a pattern” (US3). As far as measuring this constant, answers were similarly scattered. Many participants mentioned the electromagnetic spectrum but in inexplicable ways, such as “It comes to the electromagnetic spectrum” (US4) and “She slides down the light spectrum” (US4).

A few channelers asserted that there was a constant, but it could not be measured. US3 stated, “There is no way to quantify the nature of the mind without adopting a model of the soul, and a model of spirit.” Others mentioned that there was a constant that could be measured but not with the tools we currently have at our disposal. US6 stated, “Yes, there is a universal constant for the interaction between mind and matter. It is already known, though it hasn’t been recognized as such...You cannot measure that which you have yet to describe or discover.” US4 stated, “You do not have equipment at this point, which also slides down the light spectrum. Until you have equipment which does not manifest and then does manifest, almost contract the being as the being slides down.”

In summary, most channelers said there was a constant, although what that constant was and its magnitude was not apparent. The potential measurement of such a constant is likely possible but perhaps not with the available tools.

Question 5. What is What Humans Call “Matter” Made of?

Three coherent themes arose from the channelers’ answers to this question. The first revolved around matter as various forms of energy. For example, one channeler states that matter is dense energy:

Matter is an illusion... we would describe a table or a physical object that you call matter, we would say that it is extremely dense energy that has come into physical form, and beyond that, there is a shared belief system among the perception of what is being seen. (US5)

Another listed multiple energy forms, stating, “[Matter is] sound, it’s light, it’s intention, it’s frequency. Yeah, all of those things. And information, of course. And so, within that matter is information” (US7). Two other channelers (I8 and US3) mentioned sound in their answer, for example, “Matter is comprised of sound and vibration” (I8). Five channelers (I2, I4, I6, I8, and US7) mentioned vibration in their answers.

The second theme revolved around matter as a product of thought, consciousness, or mind, with 11 out of 15 channelers mentioning this concept. For example, “Matter is the concentration/fulfillment of the ‘thought from our subtle/soul part’ in Earth’sEarth’s dimension” (I1); “Matter is a type of intention” (I5); “Matter is this micro-consciousness” (US1); “Everything is made with thought” (US4); “All matter is composed of the energy of the divine mind” (US6); and “Matter is spirit force into physical form. It is the essence of alchemy, the spoken word, the command spoken or thought with intention is the power to create. Thought into form is manifestation” (US2).

Further, there was the idea that thought-forms became denser or vibrated at a particular frequency, thus becoming matter: “What you call matter is a solid state of thought-forms and vibrational frequencies” (I2), and “It is made from the same substance as thought, but with a more condensed vibration, which becomes matter” (I6).

A third, more minor, theme centered on the matter’s purpose. One channeler described matter as a learning tool for our experiences, stating,

It was created as a game, a distraction, and as an instrument for growth. We put energy, emotion, thought, love, and reproduction into a microcosm of your Universe. Each element of matter is a map and guide to your Universe, and you need to learn to use it. (I3)

In summary, answers to Question 5 were some of the more coherent, expressing that matter is a condensed form of thought/consciousness/mind with a vibratory nature.

Question 6. Why is it That With Each New Incarnation or Experience of Life, We Are Not Reminded of all the Previous Experiences and of Our True Nature?

Channelers communicated two broad themes in response to this question. One was that everything a soul experiences across their lifetimes is integrated into the soul. The other theme was that this knowledge is purposefully hidden from the person in the current incarnation so they can focus on their present life. Notably, all channelers agreed that humans experience things in past lives or other dimensions—none of them challenged that part of the question.

Channelers expressed that the experiences from each life are integrated into the soul between lives. Then, there is a resetting of the memory to facilitate learning in the next life. I5 stated, “Each life should correspond to a

'reset,' a zeroing of previous life experiences...It is not the details of other lives that count, but the experience and level of consciousness attained." Similarly, one channeler said, "each consciousness retains all experiences crucial for growth and challenges: it is the synthesis of all experiences" (18). Another shared,

Just as each day is greeted anew by the dawn, so it is with the life of the soul between lifetimes. Imagery of a wipe-off board, symbolizing the "start fresh" nature of another lifetime, yet there is a to-do list in the corner, reminding the owner of that saw that they are a work in progress. (US2)

Most channelers mentioned this idea in some way.

Some answers referred to a veil or obstacle that blocked humans from seeing the truth of reincarnation and the soul's persistence across lives. I3 stated, "In each life there is a transition, and each transition there is a veil to remove." Also expressed was the idea that the veil or forgetting enables the desired learning of each life: "For each life the important thing is that life's experience, the task assigned to it. Remembering everything is detrimental to these requirements" (14).

One channeler noted how socialization represses these experiences: "So, these experiences are happening and children are having these experiences. They are just shamed profoundly, often through Western psychiatry into silence. The interesting part is when as curious adults you come across evidence from past lives, previous incarnations" (US4).

There were multiple similar explanations for why humans are not reminded of their past-life experiences. Channelers shared that the veil makes it easier for humans to deal with their present life. If they remembered all their actions from previous lives, including negative behaviors, it could cripple their ability to be engaged in their current life. It could even be detrimental to access these experiences in that it could create suffering or be overwhelming: "it's almost too much for the human brain and the experience to look back and know and remember all of these experiences....[people can] lose their mind or go crazy or suicidal" (US7). Another channeler said, "Since physical beings on Earth are largely low to medium level, experiences from other lives are blocked because they can be more damaging than the current life" (17). These quotes suggest that human suffering comes from realizing previous lives' negative actions or inaction, which stay with people through lives in their DNA:

Some of you were not very nice people doing not

very nice things in previous lives... Every single tiny word you said, every single action you performed in every single one of those existences comes with you... in your DNA. (US4)

Further, the apparent lessons to be learned in the next life karmically balance the actions from the previous life. US4 stated, "The point is for [the person] to atone for what she did in this life...So, she does not go to jail for being a murderer in a past life, in this life...she simply atones for taking [a] life in a past life."

Some participants also shared that the information is available within each person but is blocked. At some point, humans will not need this veil anymore. US3 stated, "One day that will change, one day humanity will start to assume that they are more than they can see," and US1 stated, "Soon earthlings will know the ancient truths of their planet, species, and souls alike." Some even shared that the veil can be removed through practice or spiritual growth: "your consciousness already knows all dimensions in which you are present physically and mentally. It is up to you to remove the veil separating you from it. Potentially, you are already able to do this at birth" (12). US3 shared that a person could access information beyond the veil through specific techniques like hypnosis:

And the reason that hypnosis works is because it put you in sleep. You, you that assumes this lifetime is all you are is your own nature; it turns off the mind that assumes that what you are is what you experience in this lifetime. And as it turns that off. What it returns is your condition, your true condition, your soul's recorded experience.

In summary, all channelers aligned with the concept of reincarnation and its educational and experiential purpose integrated across multiple lifetimes. Further, the forgetting between lives allows people to focus on their current life and not be overwhelmed with the potential trauma of knowing their negative behavior or experiences from previous lives.

Question 7. What is Love?

Most channelers expressed in various forms that love is simultaneously everything and nothing, the creative force of the Universe that permeates all. Some responses focused on the enormity of love, describing it as "the all" (13) and "so much more than we comprehend... It is simultaneously everything and nothing" (US1). Several channelers emphasized love as a creative wellspring, calling love "creative" (US4) and describing it as the "creator en-

gine of the all" (I1), "the primordial spark of creation of all that exists and doesn't exist" (I2), "the source from which we all originate and the core towards which we all converge" (I4), and "a life-giving water that supports all life" (US2). US7 explained this creative force, stating, "love does create—again, it is a vibration. Certain vibrational frequencies can create physical matter. It is vibration, harmonious vibration, light and intelligence that creates."

One channeler emphasized love's prescriptive power, saying, "it's a type of law that ceaselessly governs the universe itself" (I7), while I8 conceptualized love as the "purest reflection of the Supreme Entity." Some also spoke of the distinction between personal human love and transcendent Universal love: "In human life, pleasure is fundamental in the term love invoke the concept of maximum pleasure, both spiritual and physical" (I5).

One channeler spoke of the electromagnetic nature of love and the polarized aspects of human existence.

We would define love as more than an electromagnetic frequency... it takes on electromagnetic qualities to fuel the Torus field that all energies are a part of, specifically and especially in this Universe, because [it] functions on positive and negative structures or polarities. (US5)

The same channeler spoke of a person's specific characteristics of their own love signature that reflects their spiritual development, stating, "One's ascension could be measured based on the quality and texture of the 'love field'" (US5).

In summary, Question 7 elicited coherent answers describing love as the substrate of reality, distinguished from personal human love. Less common was the electromagnetic quality of this "field" of love.

Question 8. What is the Nearest Exoplanet That Harbors Intelligent Life?

Multiple common themes arose for this question: 1) a misunderstanding about "nearest," 2) the various exoplanets with life, 3) their characteristics, and 4) space travel. Regarding the first theme, respondents expressed that what we define as closest to us is relative to how one perceives the question. The question was intended to evaluate the closest in terms of distance. US7 stated,

They're kind of laughing and chuckling at this question, because near is relative to perspective. These exoplanets that seem that there is distance between you with your visual eyes, are actually quite close when you connect with the

jump points. The jump points of the timelines where there are vortices."

Similarly, US2 stated, "This question mischaracterizes distance for what is another dimension...These other worlds exist in form and substance that are beyond the reach of telescopes and astronauts...non-physical world[s]...You can reach them with your mind."

Some channelers answered the question not in relation to distance but other factors. For example, one channeler stated that the closest exoplanet that contains intelligent life is

In the Pleiades, not because they are the closest, but because they are directly linked to Earth via creation and genetics. Furthermore, in the Multiverse, there are millions of exoplanets with intelligent life, but they are not separated by time and space because they are within the Multiverse. (I3)

Another said something similar:

We would say that looking towards the Pleiades and Antares for an exoplanet that contains intelligent life would be beneficial. And the reason that we say these two primarily is because, as far as star races are concerned, these are the beings that have contracts with the Earth. (US5)

The Pleiades was the most commonly named location, with four channelers (I1, I2, I3, US5) mentioning it. Sirius was mentioned by two channelers (I6, US1). Two other channelers (I4, US4) also mentioned Alpha Centauri. The other locations were only mentioned by one channeler (Antares, Metatron, QW Zeta Reticuli, below the North star).

There were also multiple comments about travel between these planets and that the travel happens in a way that transcends traditional views of distance and space-time. One channeler mentioned a unique vehicle: "They are capable of interstellar flight, using vehicles like clothes that surround them and allow them to get around by moving the body" (I4). Another channeler not only described locations but also described the intelligent life's appearance:

They are about 1.5 m tall, their skin is colorless, and they have very big yellow eyes with a black vertical pupil. They have a large head, and 3 to 5-digit switch, and a lump like a small ball...they have spacecraft in which they travel in space and

are perceived as negative by humans because they behave purely as researchers with no mercy or empathy, treating people like guinea pigs, not malevolently but scientifically, towards something unknown to them. (17)

Some also talked about the characteristics of the planets and civilizations. For example,

It is massive and not a full sphere. It is shaped like a Crescent made mostly of Hematite and Galena, no sand or dirt, mostly crystal and water, also showing it is [has] a moon. Not technically a planet. Ships imitate blue angular birds. It's thriving with cities and complex social structures. A utopian society still with interesting problems that we deal with in a more complex way. (US1)

In summary, the channelers' answers did not refute that there was intelligent life on exoplanets or that travel between these planets is possible. They did express that the answer to the question is different based on how "nearest" is defined. The provided answers varied depending on how the channeler perceived the question.

Question 9. What Creates Life in Plants, Animals, Bacteria, etc.?

Our ninth question yielded one common theme: the life force of individual organisms is actually an expression of a single, common life force. US1 stated, "All life and beings are fractals or pieces of source expressed in all infinite ways," while I6 stated, "Everything has spirit, even a flower has a soul which was assigned an evolutionary path, but sometimes even involutory, depending on what actions occur in the life cycle." According to US4, "Every human is a strand of consciousness, of the same consciousness of God, your all facets of God. We are facets of God, same thing." US2 stated,

The energy, the living force not unlike the energy contained in a huge wave, or the wind, or gravity, or electricity, is the force that creates and sustains life in plants, animals, and bacteria. It doesn't matter how "low/primitive" or highly developed the creature or being is; that is a matter of vibration and intensity of the "voltage."

Many channelers (I1, I2, I3, US1, US4, US5) expressed that this life force is love, and some (I1, I2, I3, US4, US7) love and intelligence/knowledge. Others expressed that

this love is a consciousness and that it creates life as a way to express itself. What creates life is "love or source. Another way to put it is consciousness plus a desire to express" (US1). Similarly, another channeler described the impulse for consciousness to experience itself, thus creating life as a path to self-knowledge. US3 stated, "When the void was out without form, it was consciousness that in no way understood itself... It was simply pure consciousness and potential pure potential... I had a real revelation and began the creation through that I am now."

Some channelers highlighted distinctions between living and non-living things, e.g., "Life is like this – an unknowable flow of energy... This flow does not involve inanimate beings such as rocks: those are emanations transformed from vibrations into matter that is dense and lacking a spiritual essence" (I8). Others, however, communicated that this distinction was an illusion; for example, "All parts of planet Earth are living, there are no non-living structures, not even rocks" (I4).

In summary, many channelers' answers were coherent in that they suggested one force creates life regardless of its manifestation, that this force is consciousness expressing itself for self-knowledge, and is love and knowledge.

Question 10. What is the Nature of Dark Matter, and How Could it Be Detected?

There were three main themes in the answers to this question: 1) a reconciliation of opposites, 2) dark matter being involved in travel, and 3) the human mind's inability to comprehend dark matter—fewer channelers mentioned how it could be detected. Multiple channelers also believed dark matter represented an important polarity, and words representing opposites (e.g., light/dark, light/shadow, matter/anti-matter, absence/presence) were frequently used (I3, I4, I5, I7, I8, US7). For example, one channeler wrote, "Dark matter is like the shadow of something which is in the light representing normal matter. In a way, the object exposed to light acts on the light itself and the shadow is a 'reaction' to this action" (I5). Further, dark matter has within it the potentiality of both sides of polarities: "Within dark matter is everything. Polarity disappears and there is the ONE and especially love which meets death and vice-versa" (I3).

Another common theme (I3, I8, US1, US4, US5, US7) was the idea that dark matter represented an opportunity for space travel. I3 stated, "It's not possible to travel across the universe without it." US4 stated, "The closest analogy would be a fiber-optic cable, through which you can travel all through what you're calling dark matter," and US5 stated, "Dark matter, in many ways, contains

portals and energies that are detectable by other races and other beings that use them to travel.”

Channelers also frequently expressed (I8, US1, US2, US3, US5) that the human mind has difficulty understanding the concept of dark matter and its nature: “That too is a structure-non-structure that is very difficult for the human mind to understand” (I8) and “Your mind will not understand it” (US1).

Another interesting concept was the relationship of dark matter to various “supreme beings.” For example, one channeler noted,

Dark matter is something like tracks left behind from the motion of Supreme Beings: each time parts of a Supreme Being direct themselves towards physical or non-physical beings, the movement generates a sort of detritus which makes up what is called Dark Matter, which is as large as the Supreme Beings themselves. (I4)

Finally, some channelers highlighted that dark matter has not yet been detected (I2) and can not be perceived with the human sense organs (I8). One shared that it can not be detected at all: “How does one detect the vacuum, the emptiness and void of outer space? It is the lack of the vibration of energetic presence. Dark matter is also devoid of that energetic vibration that is the presence of the life force” (US2). Another channeler shared that it is detectable by other races and beings who use it for travel (US5).

Few channelers mentioned how one could detect dark matter. One said it could be detected with love (I3). Another noted that there is dark matter within the human brain and that activating the brain through meditation would allow us to detect it. US5 stated,

So, we would also suggest working with the human brain into activating parts of it. We don't mean by taking human created or pharmaceutical drugs, but in working with, sitting with, meditating with, and activating your brain, this will function differently for all people. But we perceive this to be the next step as one's heart expands, one's brain expands, that once you begin to understand the dark matter in the brain, you can start to understand the dark matter out into the Universe.

One channeler even mentioned using psychedelics to be able to detect dark matter:

The way that you can tune into this -- because dark matter itself is pure consciousness... It's to do mushrooms, psilocybin... There is some connection with that vibration of psilocybin, where the intelligence turns into the jump point, these empty spaces, these dark spaces of nothingness where dark matter reside. (US7)

In summary, there was cohesion in answers about dark matter, reflecting its relationship to polarities, space travel, and that the human mind may have difficulty understanding dark matter's nature.

Scientists' Feedback

Once all the answers were collected, the team collated them and sent them to the scientists who suggested that question. The scientists were asked: 1) Do these answers make sense to you? 2) Was there anything new stated that you did not already know? 3) Is any of the information useful and/or actionable? 4) Is there anything else you want to share about the content? In general, the scientists did not find the answers useful in any actionable way.

The scientists for questions 2, 3, 5, 7, and 10 felt that “Responses are more similar (in the channeling condition) for the questions not related to physics, i.e., 2, 3, 7, perhaps because participants refer to different (mental) energies that still are not considered in the mainstream physics.” They also felt that the answers provided new information, “For some questions yes, for example, questions 3, 5, 9 and 10.” They were uncertain whether the information was useful and/or actionable: “It is hard to say, but it can be useful for future investigations.” They also commented on the potential source of information, saying, “It is still difficult to discriminate whether the sources of information are different sentient entities (even if some participants clearly describe an interaction with them) or higher levels of consciousness of participants.”

For questions 1 and 8, the answers did not make sense to the scientist, specifically, “No more than any other word-salad drivel.” They also shared that they gleaned no new information from the answers.

For question 10, the scientist stated,

There is nothing from a scientific point of view that gives me any clue or new idea about the nature of dark matter or how to search for it. The closest to a statement on the nature of dark matter is something like “dark matter is consciousnesses, and the closest to advice on how to detect it is to take a little bit of psilocybin

mushroom! I kind of like that idea.

Whether this scientist was jesting is uncertain. However, this suggestion is undoubtedly actionable as increasing avenues allow for the legal exploration of psilocybin as a vehicle for accessing altered states amenable to exploring consciousness (Hadar et al., 2023).

DISCUSSION

In summary, this exploratory study found from judging correspondence scores a low correspondence between channeled and non-channeled answers as hypothesized and virtually no correspondence for each question across channelers, contrary to our hypothesis. We also observed little support that the channelers accessed the same perceived source of information. However, we did find coherent and common themes for many but not all ten questions through qualitative thematic analysis of both sites' data. Several lessons from this study can be applied to future studies.

Channelers

Channelers self-reported their inclusion criteria. That is, most channelers stated that they had channeled scientific or technological information. However, there was no process to verify that the information they received was valid. In addition, there was heterogeneity in the channelers' experience across sites. Future studies would attempt to validate previously channeled science content before enrolling channelers in such a study and setting a higher threshold of experience to participate. We also did not formally evaluate the channelers' childhood and current religious or spiritual affiliations, which may have influenced some channeled and non-channeled responses. Additional measures could be included to assess the channelers' states during each of the conditions. For example, the Phenomenology of Consciousness Inventory (Pekala, 1991) could have been used to quantitatively evaluate phenomenological experiences of channeling and non-channeling states.

Can channelers with no scientific background channel scientific information? The lack of correspondence of the channeled answers may be because they were in contact with differing ostensible "sources of information" and experienced difficulties "translating" information with their own words and concepts, particularly when the arguments were very complex. Some suggest that whatever the source of information, the "Library of the Mind" of the channeler, consisting of their memory, education, vocabulary, and cognitive capacity, is intrinsic to the process of successfully receiving information

(Wahbeh et al., 2018). Thus, if a channeler does not know the vocabulary the "being" wants to use, then they can not use those specific words. One idea to overcome this potential limitation is to train scientists to channel; thus, the channeler would have the correct Library of the Mind to channel relevant information. One such training involves hypnotic induction into a nonlocal consciousness perceived out-of-body state that is then deepened and, with consent, allows trance channeling to occur (Pederzoli et al., 2018). This process has been successfully applied to people naive to channeling and could potentially work for scientists. Future studies could recruit scientists, train them in trance channeling, and observe if the quality, relevance, and actionability of their responses compare to non-scientist channelers of the same questions.

Question Choices

Although scientists provided the questions used in the sessions, they were metaphysical in nature, such as "What is love?" and questions about reincarnation and preparation for incarnation. We expect answers to these questions to be more explanatory rather than offering actionable tasks. Regardless, the questions that included an objective aspect, such as detecting dark matter, did not reveal more specific information, though taking psilocybin to reflect on the nature of dark matter was one of the more actionable invitations suggested. Including more verifiable questions in future studies could support the assessment of channeling's utility.

There were no structured criteria for choosing the questions used for the sessions, and the final questions were biased by the investigators' curiosity. Future studies will also include systematic methods to select the questions. Ideally, multiple iterative studies would be conducted so that various question sets could be asked, allowing the assessment of answer variation by question type (e.g., content area). The nature of the questions was also quite broad. This may have contributed to the general and diverse answers received. Future studies would ask narrower questions for more specific answers. Others have experienced challenges in appropriately framing questions during channeling and have provided suggestions, such as ensuring that they are clear and precise, and not complex and allowing a natural flow from one to the other (Kardec, 1861, Chapter XXVI). Perhaps the complexity of the questions created by the scientists and discontinuity from one topic to the next negatively impacted the study.

Some questions also included leading language that could bias the answers. For example, question one stated

three options for how a physicist could describe an observation (i.e., the collapse of a wave function, possibility turning into actuality, realization in mind of one brain of the multi-universe). These concepts arose as common themes in the answers. The question could have been stated more simply without the leading options.

Channeled versus Non-Channeled Answer Correspondence

The amount of time given for channeled answers for the U.S. channelers was twice as long as for non-channeled answers. This is reflected in the volume of words for the channeled responses compared to non-channeled ones. However, this difference in time precludes us from knowing whether the difference in the channeled versus the non-channeled answers was simply an artifact of the difference in the time given to provide answers in each state. If U.S. channelers were given 10 minutes for their non-channeled answers, perhaps they would have been more similar to their channeled answers.

Channeled Answer Correspondence

After a review of sample questions and judging criteria, the three judges conducted the correspondence judging independently, resulting in three correspondence scores for each item. The interrater reliability amongst judges was not as high as we would have liked across all comparisons, with an agreement range of 33 to 78 percent. Refinement of the judging process would support correspondence evaluation in future studies. More ideally, sophisticated automated methods could be developed and implemented to evaluate similarities and differences in the text. The current challenge with these techniques is that they cannot assess complex and abstract themes and meanings and are focused on words. Thus, similarities may be underestimated for abstract channeled material.

Source of Channeled Information

We hoped this study would offer insight into the source of channeled information. Channelers were asked to tap into the same source of information for their answers. Despite this instruction, their channeled answers were quite different, supporting that the channelers tap into an information source specific to them rather than some common source. Perhaps the channeler's ego directs the information sources and thus overlays what the source of information is from their personality mind. For example, if the channeler feels their source is a guide team, then that is what they say the source is. The U.S. channelers gave very different answers to what they believed was the source, and their answers at the surface

level were also very different, as assessed by the correspondence scores. One would expect the answers to be more similar if the same source simultaneously transmitted the same information to all channelers.

Another important point regarding the source of channeling is the *source-of-psi* problem, a topic rigorously discussed among researchers in this area. There have been multiple proposed sources of channeled information (i.e., living agent psi, superpsi, psychic reservoir, and survival) and innovative ways to test the differences between them (see Beischel & Rock, 2009; Braude, 2003; LeBel et al., 2022). This study was not designed to discern between these potential sources but focused on the channelers' perception of the source.

Channeled Answers Content

We asked the channelers to give as much detail as they liked for each question. Requesting more concise answers may have served our study's research questions better. The latitude to provide detailed information created more variability in their descriptions, even though many of the same themes arose. That is, at face level, the answers were very different, but at the content theme level, there were many similarities.

Additionally, alternative analysis methods may help glean useful information from the volumes of available channeled content. We attempted to conduct automated text analysis for this study. However, we were advised that our dataset was not eligible for automated analysis because of the small amount of data for each question. We needed thousands of records per question for effective analysis beyond basic word counts. Automated qualitative analysis would dramatically support further research into the usefulness of channeled content, as manual qualitative analysis is time-consuming, requires extensive personnel time, and can be biased by the reviewers' worldview.

Implications and Applications

The main empirical novelty of this study is that, for the first time, we tested the feasibility of testing a group of participants' ability to enter a channeling state and explore their responses to a pool of similar questions. One project goal was to examine the feasibility of evaluating whether channeling is accessing a higher intelligence than the personal self and likely one with greater knowledge. Given the opportunity to continue our investigation, we are curious to understand how to integrate channeled information to inspire scientific understanding. As art has informed science in conventionally acceptable ways (e.g., Leonardo da Vinci's *Vitruvian Man* inspired mathe-

maticians, architects, and physicians with its harmonious design (Creed, 1986)), perhaps channeled information can lead us to find novel ideas to unresolved questions in science and society. This study also has the potential to support other studies in the fields of parapsychology, consciousness studies, and mediumship.

Overall, even if exploratory, this study offered insight into improving future studies attempting to obtain useful information from channeling. Ramanujan's channeled mathematics provides a positive case that channeling could, in theory, provide useful information. Suppose group channeling consistently provided correct answers to verifiable questions. In that case, one might be more confident in coherent, collated answers from group channeling about questions to which humanity does not know the answers or cannot be verified. However, modern-day methods need to be improved to allow this theory to be realized as a practical application. Some groups are attempting just that. For example, there was a convening through the Public Parapsychology group called The Exploring Consciousness-Based Applications for Climate Action Workshop & Ideathon, where they formed three teams: one exploring "subtle activism" as a psi application, one carbon removal Xprize team, and a team working on a mobile app for collectively focusing intent (Ventola, 2021). With improved methods and continued research, perhaps channeling will provide actionable insights into critical issues humanity faces today.

This work supports the development of a methodology for validating channeled information. Should a rigorous method be established, it could be applied to the voluminous and ever-growing channeled material. The applications of validated channeled material are only limited by its content and actionability. Ideally, feasible channeled information would be verified and acted on to evaluate its usefulness. The notion that we could tap into novel solutions to problems facing our world, regardless of their source, is worth pursuing.

ENDNOTES

- ¹ Discussing the various theories behind the source of mediumistic information is beyond the scope of this paper. For reviews of the living-agent psi, psychic reservoir, or survival theories see Braude (2003) or Beischel & Rock (2009).

AUTHORS' NOTES

Author's Contributions

HW – Conceptualization, Data Curation, Formal Analysis, Investigation, Methodology, Supervision, Writing –

Original Draft Preparation, Writing – Review & Editing
PS – Data Curation, Formal Analysis, Project Administration, Writing – Original Draft Preparation

LP – Conceptualization, Data Curation, Investigation, Writing – Review & Editing

PT – Conceptualization, Data Curation, Investigation, Methodology, Project Administration, Supervision, Writing – Review & Editing

The Authors declare that there is no conflict of interest. We would like to thank the Ray Benton Fund, the Federico and Elvia Faggini Foundation, Geoff Oesler, IONS Supporters, and the study participants. Correspondence concerning this article should be addressed to Helané Wahbeh. Email: hwahbeh@noetic.org

REFERENCES

- Alcock, J. E. (1996). Channeling. In G. Stein (Ed.), *The Encyclopedia of the Paranormal* (pp. 153–160). Prometheus Books.
- Bastos, M. A. V., Bastos, P. R. H., Goncalves, L. M., Osorio, I. H. S., & Lucchetti, G. (2015). Mediumship: Review of quantitative studies published in the 21st century. *Archives of Clinical Psychiatry*, 42(5), 129–138. <https://doi.org/10.1590/0101-60830000000063>
- Beischel, J., & Rock, A. J. (2009). Addressing the survival versus psi debate through process-focused mediumship research. *The Journal of Parapsychology*, 73, 71.
- Beyerstein, D. (1996). Cayce, Edgar (1877-1945). In G. Stein (Ed.), *The Encyclopedia of the Paranormal* (pp. 146–153). Prometheus Books.
- Bourguignon, E. (1976). *Possession*. Chandler & Sharp Publishers San Francisco.
- Braude, S. E. (2003). *Immortal remains: The evidence for life after death*. Rowman & Littlefield Publishers.
- Cardeña, E., Schaffler, Y., & van Duijl, M. (2023). The Other in the Self: Possession, Trance, and Related Phenomena 1. In *Dissociation and the Dissociative Disorders* (pp. 421–432). Routledge. <https://doi.org/10.4324/9781003057314-32>
- Creed, J. C. (1986). Leonardo da Vinci, Vitruvian Man. *JAMA*, 256(12), 1541. <https://doi.org/10.1001/jama.1986.03380120011002>
- Crook, J. H. (1997). The indigenous psychiatry of Ladakh, Part I: Practice theory approaches to trance possession in the Himalayas. *Anthropology & Medicine*, 4(3), 289–307. <https://doi.org/10.1080/13648470.1997.9964539>
- Delorme, A., Cannard, C., Radin, D., & Wahbeh, H. (2020). Accuracy and neural correlates of blinded mediumship compared to controls on an image classification



- task. *Brain and Cognition*, 146, 105638. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.bandc.2020.105638>
- Dossey, L. (2013). *One Mind: How Our Individual Mind is Part of a Greater Consciousness and Why it Matters*. Hay House, Inc.
- Fontana, D. (2005). *Is there an afterlife? A comprehensive overview of the evidence*. O Books.
- Hadar, A., David, J., Shalit, N., Roseman, L., Gross, R., Sessa, B., & Lev-Ran, S. (2023). The Psychedelic Renaissance in Clinical Research: A Bibliometric Analysis of Three Decades of Human Studies with Psychedelics. *Journal of Psychoactive Drugs*, 55(1), 1–10. <https://doi.org/10.1080/02791072.2021.2022254>
- Hageman, J. H., Peres, J. F. P., Moreira-Almeida, A., Caixeta, L., Wickramasekera, I., & Krippner, S. C. (2009). The Neurobiology of Trance and Mediumship in Brazil. In S. C. Krippner & H. L. Friedman (Eds.), *Mysterious Minds: The Neurobiology of Psychics, Mediums, and Other Extraordinary People*. Praeger.
- Hastings, A. (1991). *With the tongues of men and angels: A study of channeling*. Holt, Rinehart & Winston.
- Helfrich, P. M. (2009). The Channeling Phenomenon: A multi-methodological assessment. *Journal of Integral Theory and Practice*, 4(3), 141–161.
- Hunter, J., & Luke, D. (2014). *Talking with the spirits: Ethnographies from between the worlds*. Daily Grail Publishing.
- Johnson, K. P. (1998). *Edgar Cayce in Context: The Readings: Truth and Fiction*. SUNY Press.
- Kardec, A. (1861). Questions that may be addressed to spirits. In *The Medium's Book*. <https://mail.kardecpedia.com.br/en/study-guide/884/the-mediums-book/977/part-second-spirit-manifestations/chapter-xxvi-questions-that-may-be-addressed-to-spirits>
- Kardec, A. (2022). *The gospel according to spiritism*. Kardecpedia. <http://mail.xn--kardecpdia-h7a.com.br/en/study-guide/887/the-gospel-according-to-spiritism/2052/introduction/2-the-authority-behind-the-spiritist-doctrine>
- Klimo, J. (1998). *Channeling: Investigations on receiving information from paranormal sources*. North Atlantic Books.
- Krippner, S. (2008). Learning from the spirits: Candomblé, Umbanda, and Kardecismo in Recife, Brazil. *Anthropology of Consciousness*, 19(1), 1–32. <https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1556-3537.2008.00001.x>
- Landis, J. R., & Koch, G. G. (1977). The Measurement of Observer Agreement for Categorical Data. *Biometrics*, 33(1), 159. <https://doi.org/10.2307/2529310>
- LeBel, E., Augustine, K., & Rock, A. (2022). Beyond the BICS Essays: Envisioning a More Rigorous Preregistered Survival Study. *Journal of Scientific Exploration*, 36(2), Article 2. <https://doi.org/10.31275/20222691>
- Lucchetti, G., Jr, J. C. D., Jr, D. I., Gonçalves, J. P. B., & Lucchetti, A. L. G. (2013). *Historical and cultural aspects of the pineal gland: Comparison between the theories provided by Spiritism in the 1940s and the current scientific evidence*. 12.
- Merlin, S. (2020). Beyond survival debates: Addressing the source-of-psi problem with the multiple sources of psi hypothesis (Part I). *Journal of Consciousness Exploration & Research*, 11(4).
- Moreira-Almeida, A., & Cardeña, E. (2011). *Differential diagnosis between non-pathological psychotic and spiritual experiences and mental disorders: A contribution from Latin American studies to the ICD-11: Vol. 33 Suppl 1*.
- Negro Jr, P. J., Palladino-Negro, P., & Louzã, M. R. (2002). Do religious mediumship dissociative experiences conform to the sociocognitive theory of dissociation? *Journal of Trauma & Dissociation*, 3(1), 51–73. https://doi.org/10.1300/J229v03n01_05
- Pederzoli, L., Prati, E., Resti, N., Del Carlo, D., & Tressoldi, P. E. (2018). Hypno-Channelings: A new tool for the investigation of channeling experiences. *Available at SSRN 3281560*. <https://doi.org/10.2139/ssrn.3281560>
- Pekala, R. J. (1991). The Phenomenology of Consciousness Inventory. In *Quantifying Consciousness: Emotions, Personality, and Psychotherapy*. Springer. https://doi.org/10.1007/978-1-4899-0629-8_8
- Plakun, E. M. (2008). Psychiatry in Tibetan Buddhism: Madness and Its Cure Seen Through the Lens of Religious and National History. *The Journal of the American Academy of Psychoanalysis and Dynamic Psychiatry*, 36(3), 415–430. <https://doi.org/10.1521/jaap.2008.36.3.415>
- Rock, A. J., Thorsteinsson, E. B., Tressoldi, P. E., & Loi, N. M. (2021). A Meta-Analysis of Anomalous Information Reception by Mediums: Assessing the Forced-Choice Design in Mediumship Research, 2000-2020. In *Advances in Parapsychological Research 10*. McFarland and Company, Inc.
- Roxburgh, E. C., & Roe, C. A. (2011). A survey of dissociation, boundary-thinness, and psychological wellbeing in spiritualist mental mediumship. *The Journal of Parapsychology*, 75(2), 279.
- Sagher, A., Butzer, B., & Wahbeh, H. (2019). The characteristics of exceptional human experiences. *Journal of Consciousness Studies*, 26(11–12), 203–237.
- Sarraf, M., Woodley of Menie, M. A., & Tressoldi, P. (2021). Anomalous information reception by mediums: A meta-analysis of the scientific evidence. *Explore*, 17(5), 396–402. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.explore.2020.04.002>
- CITED AS 1990 Schwartz, S. A. (1995). Creativity, intuition, and innovation. *Subtle Energies & Energy Medicine*

- Journal Archives*, 1(2).
- Seligman, R. (2005). Distress, dissociation, and embodied experience: Reconsidering the pathways to mediumship and mental health. *Ethos*, 33(1), 71–99. <https://doi.org/10.1525/eth.2005.33.1.071>
- Stöckigt, B. (2014). Spirit Possession in East Africa. In J. Hunter & D. Luke (Eds.), *Talking with the spirits: Ethnographies from between the worlds* (pp. 157–175). Daily Grail Publishing Brisbane, Qld.
- Ventola, A. (2021, December 22). *Psi & Sustainability*. <https://publicparapsychology.org/2021/12/22/psi-sustainability/>
- Wahbeh, H. (2021). *The Science of Channeling: Why You Should Trust Your Intuition and Embrace the Force That Connects Us All*. New Harbinger Publications.
- Wahbeh, H., & Butzer, B. (2020). Characteristics of English-speaking trance channelers. *EXPLORE: The Journal of Science and Healing*, 16(5), 304–309. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.explore.2020.02.002>
- Wahbeh, H., Carpenter, L., & Radin, D. (2018). A mixed methods phenomenological and exploratory study of channeling. *Journal of the Society for Psychical Research*, 82(3), 129–148.